

TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF MOTOR VEHICLES
CONSUMER SERVICE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING

OPEN MEETING VIA TELEPHONE CONFERENCE CALL

PUBLIC PHYSICAL LOCATION
Texas Department of Motor Vehicles
4000 Jackson Avenue
Building 1
Lone Star Room
Austin, Texas 78731

Monday,
December 13, 2021

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

John Ames, CSAC Presiding Officer
Kristen Hoyt, CSAC First Vice Chair
Billie Aliu, CSAC Second Vice Chair
Robert Boggus
Tina Carter (absent)
Richard Cavender
Brian Daugbjerg (absent)
Thomas Drake
Christopher Gaston
Ruben Gonzalez
Russell Hayter
Lori King
Stephen Palacios (absent)
Melissa Peace (absent)
Bruce Stidham
Susan Sutton
Ford Wagner (absent)
Christopher Wall

ON THE RECORD REPORTING
(512) 450-0342

I N D E X

<u>AGENDA ITEM</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
1. Call to Order	3
A. Roll Call and Establishment of Quorum	6
2. DISCUSSION, BRIEFING, AND ACTION ITEMS	
A. Limited Service Deputy Presentations on Potential Operational Costs Reduction Efforts	22 32
B. Tax Assessor-Collector Presentation on Potential Operational Costs Reduction Efforts	28
C. Overview and Statistical Data on Limited Service Deputy Potential Operational Costs Reduction Efforts	9 34
3. PUBLIC COMMENT	none
4. ADJOURNMENT	66

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 MR. AMES: Good morning. My name is John L. Ames,
3 and I'm pleased to open the fourth meeting of the Customer
4 Service Advisory Committee. For ease of reference, I will
5 refer to this committee as CSAC, which is an acronym for the
6 Customer Service Advisory Committee.

7 It is now 9:02 a.m., and I'm now calling the CSAC
8 meeting to order on December 13, 2021. I'd like to note for
9 the record that the public notice of this meeting, containing
10 all items on the agenda, was filed with the Office of the
11 Secretary of State on December 3, 2021.

12 This meeting is being held by telephone conference
13 call in accordance with the Texas Government Code, Chapter
14 551.125. Members of the public may physically attend this
15 meeting in person at 4000 Jackson Avenue, Building 1, Lone
16 Star Room, Austin, Texas 78731, or they may attend this meeting
17 by calling the toll-free number which has been both posted
18 in our agenda and which was filed with the Office of Secretary
19 of State on December 3, 2021.

20 At this time if all attendees will please mute your
21 phones for the entire duration of the meeting. I'm asking
22 our meeting host to make sure all participants' phones are
23 muted except for advisory committee members and those who are
24 presenting. Callers will be removed for any disruption,
25 including background noises.

1 I would also like to remind all participants that
2 this is a telephone conference call meeting. Because this
3 meeting is being held by telephone conference call, there are
4 a few things that will assist in making the meeting run smoother
5 and to assist the court reporter in getting an accurate record.

6 First, please identify yourself before speaking.

7 Second, speak clearly. Third, remember that there may be
8 a slight delay due to the telephone conference call meeting,
9 so please wait a little longer than usual before responding
10 to participants. Fourth, do not speak over others. And
11 fifth, please ask the presiding officer to proceed to be sure
12 to get recognized before speaking.

13 For advisory committee members participating by
14 phone only, please read the instructions provided to raise
15 your hand. Once unmuted by the meeting host, your line will
16 remain unmuted for the duration of the meeting. Please be
17 mindful of any background noise.

18 To limit background noise, please keep your line
19 muted on your end until you are ready to speak. When you're
20 ready to speak, unmute your line, state your name for the
21 record, then ask for the floor and wait to be recognized.

22 I'd like to also thank our court reporter today
23 who is transcribing this meeting. To make sure we have an
24 accurate record of this meeting, it is very important that
25 the advisory committee members and anyone presenting today

1 identify themselves before speaking and speak clearly and
2 slowly. And I'm going to try to speak slower too myself.

3 If you wish to address the advisory committee or
4 speak on an agenda item during today's meeting, please send
5 an email to GCO_General@TxDMV.gov. That email address again
6 is GCO [General@TxDMV.gov](mailto:GCO_General@TxDMV.gov).

7 Please identify in your email the specific item
8 you are interested in commenting on, your name and address,
9 and whether you are representing anyone or speaking for
10 yourself.

11 If your comment does not pertain to a specific
12 agenda item, we will take your comment during the general
13 public comment portion of the meeting. Comments should be
14 pertinent to the issues stated in your email. When addressing
15 the advisory committee, please state your name and affiliation
16 for the record.

17 Before we begin today, I'd like to remind all
18 presenters and those in attendance of the rules of conduct
19 at our advisory committee meeting. In the department's rules
20 under 43 TAC Section 206.22, the presiding officer is given
21 authority to supervise the conduct of the meeting.

22 This includes the authority to determine when a
23 speaker is being disruptive of the meeting or is otherwise
24 violating the timing or presentation rules as I've just
25 discussed. Disruptive speakers will be muted, given a warning

1 about disruptive behavior, then removed from the meeting for
2 any continued disruption.

3 Advisory committee members, please let us know
4 immediately if you are no longer able to participate for any
5 reason. If your phone call drops or you are disconnected,
6 TxDMV staff will interrupt the meeting to let us know to get
7 you back on the line before we proceed.

8 And now I'd like to have a roll call of the advisory
9 committee members. Please respond verbally when I call your
10 name, please indicate you are present.

11 Member Aliu?

12 MS. ALIU: This is Billie Aliu. I'm present.

13 Thank you.

14 MR. AMES: Good morning.

15 MS. ALIU: Good morning.

16 MR. AMES: Member Boggus? Member Boggus? Member
17 Boggus?

18 (No response.)

19 MR. AMES: Member Carter? Member Carter? Member
20 Carter?

21 (No response.)

22 MR. AMES: Member Cavender?

23 MR. CAVENDER: Good morning. I am present.

24 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Cavender.

25 Member Daugbjerg? Member Daugbjerg? Member

1 Daugbjerg?

2 (No response.)

3 MR. AMES: Member Drake? Member Drake? Member
4 Drake?

5 (No response.)

6 MR. AMES: Member Gaston?

7 MR. GASTON: Good morning. Member Gaston
8 present.

9 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Gaston.
10 Member Gonzalez?

11 MR. GONZALEZ: Good morning. Present.

12 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Gonzalez.
13 Member Hayter?

14 MR. HAYTER: This is Russell Hayter. I'm here.

15 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Hayter.

16 MR. HAYTER: Good morning.

17 MR. AMES: Member Hoyt?

18 MS. HOYT: Good morning. Present.

19 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Hoyt.

20 Member King? Member King?

21 MS. KING: Good morning. King present.

22 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member King.

23 Member Palacios? Member Palacios? Member
24 Palacios?

25 (No response.)

1 MR. AMES: Member Peace? Member Peace? Member
2 Peace?

3 (No response.)

4 MR. AMES: Member Stidham?

5 MR. STIDHAM: Good morning. Member Stidham
6 present.

7 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Stidham.

8 Member Sutton?

9 MS. SUTTON: Good morning. Susan Sutton present.

10 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Sutton.

11 Member Wagner? Member Wagner? Member Wagner?

12 (No response.)

13 MR. AMES: Member Wall?

14 MR. WALL: Good morning. I'm present.

15 MR. AMES: Good morning, Member Wall.

16 And I, John L. Ames, am present too. We now have
17 a quorum.

18 As a reminder, the purpose of this committee is
19 to assist the department of the Texas Department of Motor
20 Vehicles in obtaining feedback regarding important
21 legislation. Advisory committees such as CSAC provide
22 valuable input for the department in an advisory capacity
23 concerning issues relating to improving and enhancing
24 department customer service.

25 At this time, members, we will take up agenda item

1 number 2.A. I'm going to take the agenda out of order by asking
2 Roland Luna to present the first portion of agenda item 2.C,
3 consisting of an overview of the statistical data regarding
4 limited service deputies, and we're taking this out of order
5 at the request of the DMV staff.

6 So Mr. Luna, you now have the floor.

7 MR. LUNA: Good morning, Presiding Officer Ames,
8 committee members. Roland Luna, Sr., Vehicle Titles and
9 Registration Division director.

10 If you would like to follow along in your materials,
11 please refer to page 5 of your materials, and I'll give you
12 just a moment so you can find that.

13 Now that you've located page 5, you will see a
14 document that is titled Analysis of Vehicle Registration
15 Renewals Processed by Limited Service Deputies. If you will
16 look at the text box that has Summary by Fiscal Year, you will
17 see the header information that says FY, which stands for
18 fiscal year -- and I'm going to move left to right -- Dates,
19 Number of renewals processed, LSD, which stands for limited
20 service deputy, Limited service deputy count as of FY 2021,
21 Number of renewals processed by limited service deputies, and
22 Percentage of renewals processed by limited service deputies,
23 and then that last column, the Number of counties using limited
24 service deputies in fiscal year 2021.

25 We'll go back to the beginning of the table and

1 look at fiscal year 2021. The date range for fiscal years
2 for this document begins on 9/1/2020 and ends on 8/31/2021
3 for FY21. For FY20, the same 9/1 to 8/31, and then for fiscal
4 year 2019 in similar fashion, 9/1 to 8/31.

5 So the date ranges for our fiscal years for this
6 document are going to always begin on 9/1 of a given fiscal
7 year and then end the next year on 8/31.

8 I'd like to now walk you through fiscal year '21
9 on this table. So if you look at FY21, the date range for
10 9/1 of '20 through 8/31 of 2021, the number of renewals
11 processed 19,370,549.

12 The number of limited service deputy counts as of
13 FY21, total number 781 limited service deputies. The number
14 of renewals processed by limited service deputies for FY21
15 3,309,831, which accounts for 17.09 percent, and then the
16 number of counties using limited service deputies in FY21,
17 so I'm going to restate this.

18 So what this table says for FY21 is total number
19 of registration renewals processed in the entire state
20 19,370,549, the number of registration renewals processed by
21 limited service deputies 3,309,831, which is 17 percent, so
22 what this means is that 17 percent of all registration renewals
23 in the entire state for FY21 were processed by limited service
24 deputies.

25 If we move down to the next area of the document

1 that says detail by county, again look to the immediate right;
2 you'll see a beige color that says Counties utilizing limited
3 service deputies.

4 And what I would like to do here is just talk about
5 our header information first in the light blue color and
6 explain what these headers are, and then I would like to walk
7 you through three different counties, looking at a smaller
8 county, a mid-size county, and then a large county, and then
9 explain what the data is.

10 And then at this point after I explain the large,
11 medium and small county, Presiding Officer Ames, I would like
12 to take some questions before I move on to the remainder of
13 the document, if that's okay.

14 So right immediately under Detail by County, you'll
15 see a header that is titled Registered vehicles by county.

16 So what this represents are all vehicles registered in a given
17 county for a given fiscal year.

18 What this also means is that this is going to
19 account for all new vehicles that were purchased, fleet
20 vehicles that may have been purchased by an entity, trailers,
21 this is all vehicles to include initial registration.

22 If you move to the next header, it says Total number
23 of registration renewals processed. This information is
24 going to be the total number of registration renewals that
25 were processed, a registration renewal transaction.

1 This column or this header is not intended to
2 associate and be a one-for-one with the number of registered
3 vehicles by county. The number of registered vehicles by
4 county has some other variables in there such as initial
5 registration vehicles, new vehicles that were purchased that
6 aren't going to necessarily be a registration renewal.

7 Moving over to the next column, LSD count, this
8 is the limited service deputy count, which means the number
9 of limited service deputies for that fiscal year in that
10 county, in this case which is FY21.

11 And then the next column, Registration renewals
12 processed by limited service deputies, and then we have that
13 information for three fiscal years, for FY21, for FY20, and
14 for FY19.

15 What I would like to do now is walk you through
16 the first county that is highlighted in the beige color,
17 Angelina County. Angelina County, registered vehicles by
18 county, so the total number of vehicles registered by county
19 in FY21 in Angelina County 82,332 for FY21, for FY20 79,722,
20 and for FY19 83,621.

21 Continuing to move to the right, the total number
22 of registration renewals processed in Angelina County for FY21
23 64,211, for FY20 61,447, and for FY19 64,558.

24 Total number of limited service deputies utilized
25 by Angelina County for FY21 five, and then looking at -- and

1 this is where I really want to slow down and emphasize this
2 point -- so if we're looking at the registration renewals
3 processed by limited service deputies, Angelina County FY21,
4 there was 478 registration renewals processed by limited
5 service deputies, which accounts for .74 percent of one
6 percent, so under one percent of registration renewals were
7 processed in Angelina County by limited service deputies in
8 FY21, and then we have the same information laid out in similar
9 fashion for FY20 and for FY19.

10 If we move down to Bastrop County -- I'll give you
11 a moment just to find Bastrop County -- moving left to right,
12 and I'm going to isolate FY21. So the registered vehicles,
13 all registered vehicles in Bastrop County for FY21 104,272,
14 the total number of registration renewals processed in Bastrop
15 County for FY21 81,088, the number of limited service deputies
16 in Bastrop County, two.

17 For FY21 registration renewals processed by
18 limited service deputies 2,068, so in Bastrop County, 2.55
19 percent of registration renewals were processed by limited
20 service deputies, completed by limited service deputies for
21 FY21. We have the same information laid out in similar fashion
22 for FY20 and for FY19.

23 I would like to move down the document, and if you
24 could find Bexar County on your document, it's in the middle
25 of that page on page 5. Registered vehicles by county for

1 FY21 for Bexar County, so in Bexar County the total number
2 of vehicles registered for FY21 1,635,746, the total number
3 of registration renewals processed in Bexar County 1,226,554.

4 Continuing to move to the right, the total number
5 of limited service deputies in Bexar County, 47, and then the
6 registration renewals processed by limited service deputies,
7 so for FY21 271,808 registration renewals were processed by
8 limited service deputies, so in this county 22.16 -- so I'm
9 going to round -- 22 percent of all registration renewals were
10 completed by limited service deputies in Bexar County.

11 And you can see if you continue to move to the right
12 for FY20 in Bexar County 267,298 so that's 23 percent of all
13 registration renewals were processed by limited service
14 deputies in Bexar County, and then for FY19 22 percent of all
15 registration renewals were processed by limited service
16 deputies.

17 We have every county for the entire state that has
18 all the information for limited service deputies and the amount
19 of transactions that are completed for limited service
20 deputies.

21 One of the things that we wanted to make sure that
22 we were doing when we were running all of our reports and
23 compiling the data, we wanted to make sure that we could
24 validate our data, and one of the methods that we came up with
25 to ensure that we validated the data was to make sure that

1 we were pulling transactional data from limited service
2 deputies that completed a transaction.

3 So let's say that a given county, County X, has
4 50 limited service deputies on contract or they have an
5 agreement with but only 40 of those limited service deputies
6 completed a transaction for a given fiscal year, FY19, FY20,
7 FY21, we were only pulling data for a limited service deputy
8 that completed a transaction. So that was able to provide
9 us with some validity to our data to ensure that we're providing
10 good information to the committee today.

11 If you will continue to scroll, on page 6 of the
12 document we have the similar information at the top fo
13 reference, summary of information by fiscal year for FY21,
14 '20 and '19.

15 We have this at the top of every page as you continue
16 to scroll through every county, all 254 counties in the state
17 of Texas. I will give you a moment to look at each county,
18 or if there is a particular county that you are interested
19 in to look at the information, and I will take any questions
20 that you have before I move on to the last part of the data
21 analysis.

22 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna.

23 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

24 As you're scrolling through, remember the counties
25 are listed in alphabetical order so it will be easier to find

1 the one you may be interested in.

2 Mr. Luna, you did an excellent job of explaining
3 the data on here. I do want to reiterate that these are
4 renewals only and not initial registration. When I personally
5 read the data first I thought we were missing some numbers,
6 but there are a significant amount of vehicles every year that
7 have an initial registration at the time of title transfer,
8 and those are not included in these renewal numbers, and so
9 we're only talking renewals today.

10 I also think it's a good point of interest to say
11 that 23.6 percent of all counties use at least one limited
12 service deputy.

13 Members, do you have any questions until Mr. Luna
14 moves forward? Committee members, any questions so far for
15 Mr. Luna?

16 MR. GONZALEZ: Chairman Ames, Member Gonzalez.
17 Permission to speak?

18 MR. AMES: Absolutely, Member Gonzalez. Please
19 proceed.

20 MR. GONZALEZ: Thank you.

21 I'd like to ask Mr. Luna if these renewals, do they
22 include -- just for clarification, do they include the online
23 registration renewals and also the registration renewals that
24 are done through the IRP and fleet registrations?

25 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and

1 Registration Division director.

2 It includes all registration renewals, Mr.
3 Gonzalez.

4 MR. GONZALEZ: Thank you very much, Roland.

5 MR. LUNA: Yes, sir.

6 MR. AMES: Thank you, gentlemen.

7 Members, any other questions for Mr. Luna? Any
8 other questions for Mr. Luna so far?

9 (No response.)

10 MR. AMES: All right. Seeing none, Mr. Luna,
11 please proceed forward.

12 MR. LUNA: Thank you, Presiding Officer Ames.
13 Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and Registration Division
14 director.

15 If I could direct your attention to page 14 of your
16 committee packet, and while you're scrolling to page 14, the
17 title of this particular page is Limited Service Deputy
18 Registration Renewals by County, and you will find, in similar
19 fashion, that says LSD Renewals Top Ten Counties. Nueces
20 County should be highlighted in beige as well, and it is one
21 of our top ten counties, but I would like to walk you through
22 this information.

23 So for Harris County, Dallas County, Tarrant
24 County, Bexar County, Travis County, Fort Bend County, Collin
25 County, Montgomery County, Hidalgo County, and Nueces County,

1 those are the top ten counties for registration renewals
2 completed by limited service deputies. So I will walk you
3 through a few of these to understand the information.

4 If you will find Harris County right underneath
5 the county header, for fiscal year 2021 there were 1,105,557
6 registration renewals completed by limited service deputies
7 in Harris County. For fiscal year 2020 1,047,145 were
8 completed by LSDs, and then for FY19 1,060,447.

9 So you can see with the top ten counties that have
10 the highest amounts of transactions completed by limited
11 service deputies; you can see that these are a significant
12 amount of transactions completed in these counties. We have
13 broken it down so that you can see the remainder of the counties
14 throughout the state of Texas.

15 And if you will move to page 15, I would like to
16 explain the very top of page 15. On the very top of page 15
17 you will see Harris County and Dallas County that are
18 highlighted in beige, and then immediately under Dallas County
19 you will see Rusk, Jones, Carson, Chambers.

20 We've provided this information on the next page
21 for reference so that you can see those top two counties in
22 the state that have the highest number of limited service
23 deputy transactions, and you can see those with these other
24 counties that are utilizing limited service deputies.

25 Presiding Officer Ames, with that I'll take any

1 questions that the committee may have or you may have about
2 this page.

3 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna. Excellent
4 presentation of the data that you've provided.

5 Members, any questions for Mr. Luna? Committee
6 members, any questions for Mr. Luna?

7 MR. GONZALEZ: Chairman Ames, Member Gonzalez.
8 Permission to speak?

9 MR. AMES: Yes, sir. Please proceed.

10 MR. GONZALEZ: Mr. Luna, I'd like to ask a
11 clarification. In my previous question, does it include
12 renewals that are conducted at contracted offices like the
13 kind we have here in El Paso?

14 MR. AMES: Member Gonzalez, I believe you are
15 referring to full service deputies. Would that be correct?

16 MR. GONZALEZ: That is correct. Thank you.

17 MR. AMES: Mr. Luna.

18 MR. LUNA: Thank you, sir. Roland Luna, Vehicle
19 Titles and Registration Division director.

20 Sir, if you will refer to -- let's go back to page
21 5 so that we're looking at the same page, Member Gonzalez,
22 and right under Detail by County, Registered vehicles by
23 county, and then the next column that says Total number of
24 registration renewals processed, yes, sir, it will include
25 all transactions, all renewals that are completed within a

1 given county by all entities.

2 And then to the far right where we have the number
3 of registration renewals processed by limited service
4 deputies, that is going to be specific to limited service
5 deputies. So what we're trying to do is to say here are all
6 the registered vehicles in a given county, and then the next
7 column will be these are all the registration renewals
8 completed in a given county, and then the next column these
9 are the registration renewals that are completed specifically
10 by limited service deputies.

11 So the long way of answering your question, Member
12 Gonzalez, the answer is yes.

13 MR. GONZALEZ: Thank you so much. Thank you for
14 the clarification.

15 MR. LUNA: Yes, sir.

16 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna.

17 Presiding Officer Ames here.

18 For the rest of the members, I would like to explain
19 there is two different categories of service deputies, there
20 is a full service deputy and a limited service deputy. We
21 heard about that at our last meeting. There's just a handful
22 of counties that have full service deputies, El Paso being
23 one of those, and full service deputies can process initial
24 title registration and they can process renewals.

25 So Mr. Luna, am I to understand that the numbers

1 in this second column are only the renewals processed by full
2 service deputies and not initial registration. Correct?

3 MR. LUNA: Yes, sir. Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles
4 and Registration Division director.

5 Yes, sir, you're exactly right, Presiding Officer
6 Ames.

7 MR. AMES: Thank you. I just wanted to do that
8 for clarification.

9 Members, any questions based on these discussions?
10 Committee members, any questions for Mr. Luna about any of
11 these items?

12 (No response.)

13 MR. AMES: All right. Hearing none, we will
14 proceed.

15 Thank you very much, Mr. Luna. We appreciate your
16 thoroughness on that.

17 Members, as a reminder, if you want to comment or
18 ask questions, don't forget to unmute yourself and proceed
19 forward like Member Gonzalez did.

20 Okay. At this time, members, I will now move to
21 agenda item number 2.A. Limited Service Deputy presentations
22 on operational costs reduction efforts.

23 Before I turn the meeting over to Roland Luna,
24 director of VTR Division, who will introduce the limited
25 service deputy guests, I'd like to say that I am delighted

1 to have participation from both limited service deputies and
2 county tax assessors at today's meeting.

3 This committee is committed to making good
4 recommendations to the DMV but can only do so when we have
5 a full list of the issues and some recommendations for
6 resolving those issues, so thank you all for being here today.

7 I will also ask that each of the presentations today
8 be approximately 15 minutes. Should you have more than one
9 person speaking during your presentation, for the sake of time,
10 please do not repeat items that have already been addressed.

11 Committee members, we will be hearing all of the
12 presentations and Mr. Luna's wrap-up of item 2.C before
13 engaging in questions and discussions. Again, let me repeat.

14 We're going to hear all presentations and Mr. Luna's wrap-up
15 of item 2.C before engaging in questions and discussion.

16 Members, at that time you are welcome to ask any
17 of the presenters questions today once you've been recognized.

18 You may want to take some notes of questions you intend to
19 ask after the presentations.

20 Presenters, please wait to be recognized before
21 answering the questions. If another presenter has additional
22 information to contribute to that specific question, please
23 ask to be recognized prior to speaking.

24 Thank you to all of our limited service deputy
25 representatives for attending today's meeting and making your

1 presentations.

2 At this time I'll introduce Mr. Luna, who will then
3 introduce our presentations.

4 MR. LUNA: Thank you, Presiding Officer Ames.
5 Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and Registration Division
6 director.

7 Today we have H-E-B that will provide some brief
8 commentary on their limited service deputy experience. We
9 have Ms. Stephanie Afflerbach from H-E-B and possibly some
10 other staff that will provide some brief commentary, Presiding
11 Officer Ames, and at the conclusion of her remarks, she is
12 available for any questions or any points of clarification
13 that you or the committee may have.

14 And at this time, I'll turn it over to Ms.
15 Afflerbach.

16 MR. AMES: Thank you. Welcome, Ms. Afflerbach.
17 Did I say that right, Afflerbach?

18 MS. AFFLERBACH: It was very close. Thank you,
19 Officer Ames, and thank you, Roland, for the introduction.

20 I don't have a formal presentation to share, but
21 I did want to express my appreciation for the dialogue and
22 for you all being available for this conversation.

23 We have been processing vehicle registration
24 renewals for multiple decades in our stores and have
25 appreciated the partnerships with our county partners for all

1 of those years.

2 We have had this conversation, I think, several
3 times before trying to figure out how to make the process more
4 efficient, so I think we had a very in-depth conversation with
5 our top counties and the DMV group probably five, six years
6 ago.

7 We restarted the conversation several months ago
8 and have just been asking for feedback from some of our top
9 counties that we service and also the DMV group on how we can
10 address things that seem not as efficient as possible for us
11 and things that are contributing to us providing the service
12 at a loss, at a revenue loss today when we account for
13 operational costs that go into us providing the service.

14 So again, I very much appreciate the conversation.

15 I wanted to make myself available for questions and points
16 of clarification. The ultimate goal for us is to continue
17 these partnerships in a way that's mutually beneficial, so
18 that we come to a mutual understanding on things that help
19 both of us.

20 And so if there's something that a particular
21 county is requiring of us that is cumbersome that we understand
22 why the county is asking that of us, and then in the same aspect,
23 if there's something that H-E-B or other limited service
24 deputies are doing that could make the process more efficient
25 for DMV or for our county partners, that we understand that

1 as well.

2 So I again want to just make myself available for
3 a conversation and for any questions or clarification. I know
4 this group has had a very lengthy conversation at your last
5 meeting, and I hope that some good dialogue came from that,
6 and hopefully you have a very long list of questions for me.

7 Appreciate the conversation.

8 MR. AMES: Thank you, Ms. Afflerbach. If you will
9 stay on and after all the presentations you will be available
10 for questions, that will be fantastic.

11 Mr. Luna, our next presenter?

12 MR. LUNA: Thank you, Presiding Officer Ames.
13 Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and Registration Division
14 director.

15 We have Stephanie Curtis from Kroger Grocery Stores
16 that is on the phone. Can she be elevated to a panelist?
17 We had some technical difficulty, and she had difficulty
18 logging in to the meeting, Officer Ames, but if we could have
19 her elevated, she would provide some commentary at this time.

20 MR. AMES: DMV team, are we able to elevate Ms.
21 Curtis?

22 MR. RICHARDS: David Valdez, are you able to
23 accommodate the request?

24 MR. VALDEZ: Okay. What was the name again?

25 MR. LUNA: Stephanie Curtis.

1 MR. VALDEZ: Just a moment.

2 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
3 Registration Division director.

4 Ms. Curtis, if you will also dial *3 to raise your
5 hand and that will help Mr. Valdez identify who you are to
6 elevate you as a panelist.

7 MR. VALDEZ: I don't see a hand raised at this time
8 for Stephanie.

9 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
10 Registration Division director.

11 Ms. Valdez, I do see one hand that is raised.

12 MR. VALDEZ: Yeah. I'm unable to make her a
13 panelist because she dialed in as a user, as a common user.

14 MR. RICHARDS: David Valdez, can you contact her
15 offline and try to get her on the call, please.

16 MR. VALDEZ: Yes.

17 MR. RICHARDS: Thank you.

18 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Richards.

19 While we're doing that, for the sake of time -- this
20 is Presiding Officer Ames -- would it be appropriate to move
21 to item 2.B and then come back and finish up item 2.A?

22 MR. RICHARDS: Presiding Officer Ames, you're
23 clearly able to do that if you'd like to right now.

24 MR. AMES: Okay. Mr. Luna, if you would, let's
25 move to item 2.B. If you will make the introductions, it's

1 my understanding that item 2.B is a tax assessor-collector
2 presentation on potential operational costs reduction
3 efforts. I will turn the meeting over to Mr. Luna so he can
4 introduce the tax assessors present today.

5 MR. LUNA: Thank you, Presiding Officer Ames.
6 Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and Registration Division
7 director.

8 Today, committee members, we have two members from
9 the Tax Assessor-Collector Association. We have president
10 Randy Riggs from McLennan County, and we also have Michelle
11 French, who is the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles Tax
12 Assessor-Collector Association liaison, and they are here
13 today to provide brief commentary, as well as take some
14 questions from the committee members that you may have.

15 And with that, I'll turn it over to Ms. French and
16 Mr. Riggs.

17 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna.

18 Ms. French, Mr. Riggs, the floor is yours.

19 MS. FRENCH: Good morning. This is Michelle
20 French, and thank you very much, Presiding Officer Ames and
21 committee members, and Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
22 Registration director, and all attendees.

23 We would like to take this opportunity to thank
24 the Customer Service Advisory Committee for allowing us to
25 speak today. We do understand that there are concerns

1 regarding the limited service deputy process, and the
2 relationship between county tax assessor-collector offices
3 and our limited service deputies is a very important one and
4 we do absolutely value that relationship.

5 It is our goal to represent the tax
6 assessor-collector community to develop a best practices
7 document to service the limited service deputies, our tax
8 offices, and most importantly, the taxpayer and our motorists.

9 We hope that the ability to develop and encourage
10 the use of a best practices protocol will assist all parties
11 in managing this process that's mutually agreeable to all.

12
13 With 254 counties in Texas, there may not be as
14 much continuity in the way in which this process is currently
15 performed; however, we hope working together with our counties
16 and our limited service deputies can served to bring more
17 uniformity to address most of the concerns for all parties.

18 And this concludes my remarks. Thank you,
19 Presiding Officer Ames.

20 MR. AMES: Thank you, Ms. French.

21 Mr. Riggs, did you have comments also?

22 MR. RIGGS: Yes, Presiding Officer Ames. This is
23 Randy Riggs, the president of the Tax Assessor-Collectors
24 Association of Texas, and have the honor of serving the
25 citizens of McLennan County as the tax assessor-collector.

1 Presiding Officer Ames, thank you for your
2 leadership in this committee, and I want to thank all the
3 members of the Customer Service Advisory Committee, as well
4 as the staff of the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles.

5 Like Michelle said, there's 254 counties in the
6 state of Texas, which means that in our little world there's
7 254 different ways of doing things. Well, in this situation
8 specifically, there's only 60 counties, and I think based on
9 the communication that we are identifying here that if we are
10 able to work with those 60 counties that we can come up with
11 some type of best practice that we can utilize within our
12 industry to best work with our partners as limited service
13 deputies.

14 Now, the charge of the committee is to look at
15 potential operational costs reduction efforts. The efforts
16 that we as an association have gone through are somewhat
17 limited because the operational costs are, in a sense, indirect
18 operational costs.

19 So that's why it is so important to communicate
20 along these lines to be able to hear from our partners to hear
21 what it is that they go through and where it is that we can
22 help, and we look forward to that, and I am available for
23 questions as well.

24 And once again, thank you for the opportunity.

25 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Riggs.

1 And thank you to both the tax assessor-collectors
2 for being on the call today and for keeping comments positive
3 and brief. We appreciate that.

4 It's my understanding, Director Luna, that we now
5 have Ms. Curtis available on the call.

6 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
7 Registration Division director.

8 Yes, sir, Presiding Officer Ames.

9 Ms. Curtis, if I can get you to press *3 once
10 you're recognized, then Mr. Valdez will open up the floor so
11 that you can address the committee.

12 MR. VALDEZ: She's currently unmuted as well.

13 MR. LUNA: Ms. Curtis?

14 MS. CURTIS: Can you hear me?

15 MR. AMES: Yes, Ms. Curtis. The floor is yours.

16 MS. CURTIS: Oh, okay. And I just sent an email
17 to Roland and Patricia, who had initially reached out to me.
18 We were unable to connect, obviously, via the website. We
19 don't really have anything to present at this time, we just
20 had a few questions and not really anything in-depth, but we
21 are here.

22 I have three of my team members on this call so
23 that we are getting a lot of the input, a lot of the information,
24 but honestly, we don't have any presentation materials, so
25 to speak. We just kind of want to give feedback and kind of

1 ask some questions.

2 MR. AMES: Ms. Curtis, since it is your time for
3 the floor, if you had questions you wanted to ask, you can
4 present those now, and then the committee can discuss those
5 or ask the staff to respond to those.

6 MS. CURTIS: Okay. So we had a couple of questions
7 regarding the application that we use to obviously process
8 car tags in our location. The only thing we really have
9 questions on is the programming.

10 Again, we use this on a daily basis, and we have
11 a lot of stores that process tags in multiple counties, and
12 a lot of our stores are having issues as far as updating their
13 password information on getting into your system. And then
14 we have an issue with out-of-state car tags and things like
15 that.

16 One of the main issues we're having is if a
17 car -- you know, a person comes to renew their tags and they
18 answer no to not having the inspection report, we've noted
19 that it's automatically letting our stores process this.

20 So I kind of wanted to get some feedback on that
21 regarding is this the normal steps that are in place, or is
22 there something that we need to be doing and catching so that
23 people are not going to, in turn, take advantage of this and
24 say, oh, I don't need my car tag report; I can just get my
25 stuff done.

1 So if you guys have some feedback on that, we would
2 greatly appreciate it so that we can advise our advise our
3 store teams what to do in case this does become an issue.

4 MR. AMES: Officer Ames here.

5 Ms. Curtis, thank you for these questions. This
6 is great feedback. The system that you use to process vehicle
7 registrations on behalf of county tax assessors is provided
8 at the behest of the Department of Motor Vehicles, and it is
9 a system called webSUB, and it is actually a process through
10 the Registration and Title System, commonly known to us as
11 RTS.

12 So if that is the end of your presentation, we'll
13 proceed forward, and hopefully within our discussion we'll
14 be able to answer those questions to you.

15 Anything further, Ms. Curtis?

16 MS. CURTIS: No, that is it. Thank you.

17 MR. AMES: Thank you very much.

18 Well, as we proceed forward, members, I would just
19 again like to thank both H-E-B's Stephanie Afflerbach and
20 Kroger's Stephanie Curtis for attending today and providing
21 us some information, and more importantly, just being here
22 for questions that our committee may have.

23 In addition, I would like to thank Ms. French and
24 Mr. Riggs for being here today on behalf of the tax
25 assessor-collectors.

1 So at this time, we will move to item 2.C. Limited
2 Service Deputy potential operational costs reduction efforts,
3 and I will turn the meeting over to Roland Luna, director of
4 VTR, and after that, committee, we will open up our discussion
5 and questions.

6 Mr. Luna, the floor is yours.

7 MR. LUNA: Thank you, Presiding Officer Ames.
8 Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and Registration Division
9 director.

10 Committee members, you have heard information
11 today regarding statistical analysis for three different
12 fiscal years, FY21, FY20, and FY19.

13 As a reminder, we talked about the total number
14 of registered vehicles in a particular county. We also
15 expanded on that and talked about the number of registration
16 renewals that are processed in a particular county, and then
17 lastly, we specified the number of transactions completed by
18 limited serviced deputies in a given county.

19 We've also heard from Kroger and H-E-B, and we
20 wanted to just remind the committee members with this agenda
21 item about some of the operational costs reduction efforts
22 that we have previously discussed at our last meeting. Just
23 as a reminder for the committee members, these reduction
24 efforts that were either providing a tax assessor-collector
25 or by a limited service deputy.

1 One of them was oversight of recordkeeping and
2 holding time for paperwork, that it varies across the counties;
3 bond amounts that they vary across counties; contractual
4 agreements vary across counties; record retention
5 requirements also vary across counties.

6 Some counties require limited service deputies to
7 pick up registration sticker paper from one county.
8 Identification requirements related to registration renewal
9 processing varies across counties. Limited service deputies
10 must provide their own printers and toner.

11 Some counties require the retention of money order
12 stubs and certain reports, while other counties do not.
13 Inventory management requirements differ across counties.

14 And then lastly, some counties deputize the
15 location while other counties deputize the individual at the
16 entity, whether it be a grocer or any other type of entity.

17 We did want to provide these verbally just for your
18 reference so that you and the committee can have any discussion
19 with the limited service deputies or the Tax
20 Assessor-Collectors Association members that are represented
21 here today.

22 And with that, Officer Ames, I'll take any
23 questions and turn it back over to the committee members.
24 Thank you.

25 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna. I appreciate your

1 service today.

2 Members, it's now time. I hope that you've heard
3 the presentations today given by our presenters and you've
4 jotted down some questions. I definitely have jotted down
5 some questions, but I'd like to open it up to our member panel.

6 So any members, at this time, raise your hand, your
7 digital hand, if you will, and once recognized you may proceed.

8 You can ask questions to anybody who has presented today or
9 the DMV staff.

10 So we would like to start the discussion. We've
11 had some great conversation at the last meeting, and now that
12 we actually have some people here that may answer some of those
13 questions, I think it would be great if we move forward.

14 So committee members, any questions for any of our
15 presenters today? The floor is open. Committee members, the
16 floor is open.

17 (No response.)

18 MR. AMES: Okay. As you're reviewing your
19 questions, I did have one, and this question is for both
20 Stephanies from H-E-B and Kroger. Thank you both for having
21 an easy name today, Stephanie, to remember. I appreciate
22 that.

23 My question will be one of the things that Mr. Luna
24 just mentioned is that toners for your printers -- would both
25 limited service deputies, H-E-B and Kroger, would that be a

1 benefit if the county tax office, through the Department of
2 Motor Vehicles, provided you toner, or would that really make
3 a difference?

4 Let's start with H-E-B Stephanie.

5 MS. AFFLERBACH: Thank you, Presiding Officer
6 Ames. This is Stephanie Afflerbach with H-E-B.

7 I think that would certainly make a difference.

8 We are considering all aspects of how we reduce costs or create
9 efficiencies, so toner and the use of our printer is definitely
10 contributing to a cost for the program.

11 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie.

12 Stephanie Curtis from Kroger, same question.
13 Would toner being provided by the tax assessors through the
14 Department of Motor Vehicles be a benefit to the LSDs?

15 She may have to dial *3 again.

16 MS. CURTIS: Hi. Can you hear me?

17 MR. AMES: Yes, ma'am.

18 MS. CURTIS: Yes, we believe that would be a
19 benefit for several of our stores.

20 MR. AMES: Fantastic. Thank you.

21 Members, any other questions for H-E-B Stephanie
22 or Kroger Stephanie?

23 MS. ALIU: This is Billie Aliu. Yes, Mr. Ames,
24 I have a question.

25 MR. AMES: Yes, ma'am. Please proceed.

1 MS. ALIU: I think last meeting I asked what are
2 the costs. Have we seen a list that I'm missing of what the
3 current costs are so that we can possibly determine what other
4 cost reductions could happen other than the print cartridges?

5 Thank you.

6 MR. AMES: Great question, Member Aliu.

7 Stephanie from H-E-B, we'll let you take that
8 first. Have you guys identified the costs of actually
9 providing the stickers on behalf of H-E-B?

10 MS. AFFLERBACH: Thank you, Officer Ames, and
11 thank you, member, for the question.

12 Yes. We do have an extensive list calculating the
13 ROI on offering this service and what our costs are and what
14 the benefits, including hard costs and soft costs and hard
15 benefits and soft benefits, and there are a number of costs.

16 I will say that most of them are administrative
17 in nature, and you know, we do have an H-E-B partner who
18 performs the service, and there's a labor cost to us processing
19 the renewal at the store level.

20 There is also potentially a card interchange cost
21 if the customer is paying with a debit card. Several of the
22 other costs that are administrative in nature have to do with
23 personnel at the corporate office or personnel on our legal
24 team or on our compliance team managing contracts, managing
25 requirements for paperwork retention and managing the bond

1 amounts and when those are due and the varying amounts and
2 making sure that those are renewed. So I will say that a number
3 of the costs are related to labor at our store level or
4 corporate office.

5 MR. AMES: Thank you. This is Presiding Officer
6 Ames.

7 Stephanie from H-E-B, if I heard you correctly,
8 and help me understand, the majority of your costs are
9 administrative and not necessarily the front-end labor.
10 Obviously those are the ones printing the stickers, but you're
11 saying that the most cost efficiencies could be found in the
12 administrative level. Correct?

13 MS. AFFLERBACH: That's correct, Officer Ames.
14 And several of our questions were around streamlining the
15 processes, and I think a best practices document is a great
16 step if counties are willing to take a look at streamlining
17 even contracts, verbiage on the contracts, timing of the
18 contracts.

19 The costs that are probably more within control
20 of our tax assessor county partners have to do with the bond
21 requirements, the amount of bonds that we're required to hold.

22 We do have at least one county that requires us to deputize
23 at the individual level, and they assess us a charge for doing
24 that, so there is a fee that we pay to deputize individuals
25 in one of our counties.

1 There are other fees, I know you mentioned, related
2 to how we collect sticker paper. Some of the counties require
3 us to have a partner drive to pick up the paper, some of the
4 counties require us to have a courier pick up the paper and
5 we pay the courier costs. If those are very small amounts
6 of paper, then we're doing that pretty frequently. So those
7 are some of the hard costs that are probably within control
8 of our county partners.

9 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie. That is great
10 information for us to know directly from you at H-E-B.

11 As a follow-up question to Member Aliu -- and then
12 I'm going to ask Stephanie from Kroger if she would also
13 respond -- but what mentioned in there was timing of contracts
14 and bonds.

15 Would it be helpful if bonds and contracts were
16 on a fiscal year or on a calendar year and they all renewed
17 at the same time for every single county?

18 MS. AFFLERBACH: Officer Ames, this is Stephanie
19 Afflerbach with H-E-B.

20 Yes, that would definitely be helpful. As I
21 mentioned, some of our administrative costs are tied to having
22 someone on our legal team manage when contracts are up for
23 renewal and reviewing the terms every time that they're up
24 for renewal to make sure that we don't need to update terms.

25 So if the contract verbiage was more consistent

1 and the timing was more consistent, that would certainly save
2 us time and effort on our corporate side.

3 MR. AMES: Thank you very much for your feedback.

4 Presiding Officer Ames here.

5 Stephanie Curtis from Kroger. The question from
6 Member Aliu was the costs to provide the tags from the limited
7 service deputies. Do you have any feedback or comments
8 related to that?

9 MS. CURTIS: Yes. We're going to basically say
10 the exact same thing that Stephanie from H-E-B said, and also
11 to add on that, you know, postage or basically mailing costs
12 are going to be probably one of the higher costs after labor,
13 so anything to help out with that cost, because most of our
14 stores are mailing things in weekly and it does cost a lot
15 of money.

16 Some of our stores are doing FedEx deliveries
17 because of other issues that we have had with mail theft at
18 several of our locations. So we do pay a lot more for just
19 paying to get the paperwork to a county office.

20 Every once in a while if it's a dire situation,
21 we have associates from our stores driving to county offices
22 to drop off the paperwork, so again, there's a lot of charges
23 that are possibly involved in that situation as well. But
24 we would have to do a little bit more digging to really see
25 what that cost is hitting us when it comes to all those things

1 that were mentioned beforehand.

2 MR. AMES: Thank you, Ms. Curtis.

3 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

4 So I've got you down as a ditto-plus, and so I
5 appreciate that. And so would you also agree with H-E-B that
6 administrative is probably the highest cost inefficiencies
7 that you have at this point?

8 MS. CURTIS: Was that for Stephanie at Kroger?

9 MR. AMES: Yes.

10 MS. CURTIS: Yes, I do agree with that statement.

11 MR. AMES: Okay. Thank you very much. Thank you
12 both, ladies.

13 Members, any other further questions for the
14 limited service deputies or the tax assessors present today?

15 MS. AFFLERBACH: Officer Ames, this is Stephanie
16 Afflerbach with H-E-B. May I add one more comment?

17 MR. AMES: Yes, ma'am. Please do.

18 MS. AFFLERBACH: The other factor that is in
19 control of the tax assessor partners is the way that we transmit
20 payments. A number of our counties require checks, paper
21 checks, or money orders.

22 To some of the comments made by my counterpart at
23 Kroger, the way that we're having to send or deliver payments
24 is also a cost. Some of our counties are able to
25 electronically receive or send payments, and that is helpful.

1 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie from H-E-B. I
2 really appreciate that feedback also.

3 We have found here in Dallas that we offer the ACH
4 or the wire ability, and some people prefer to use checks,
5 so I think it's on both ends for that, but I think anything
6 electronic is definitely preferable. So that is great
7 feedback. Thank you very much.

8 Kroger Stephanie Curtis, would you agree that
9 electronic payment would be a benefit for you?

10 MS. CURTIS: Yes. So as you mentioned Dallas
11 County having that finally being offered, we'll probably work
12 at our office level to get that set up for our Dallas stores,
13 because Dallas County is -- for our level of stores, that's
14 where a lot of opportunity is cost-wise when it comes to money
15 orders getting lost in the mail.

16 So if we could actually work together to get Dallas
17 County stores on the ACH program, that would be very beneficial
18 for our team here, because we already have two other counties,
19 Tarrant County and Collin County, already on the ACH process,
20 so if we could get Dallas involved, that would basically put
21 all of our major counties on that same streamlined process,
22 which would make some of our issues go away and our cost issues
23 kind of decrease in that same regard.

24 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie from Kroger. As
25 the Dallas County tax assessor, I might have some pull in

1 getting that done, so it's a service we've offered for quite
2 some time, and my team will be in contact with you, and
3 hopefully we'll be done by the end of the week with that one.

4 MS. CURTIS: That sounds great.

5 MR. AMES: Appreciate that.

6 Members, committee members, any other questions
7 to the limited service deputies here today or the tax
8 assessors? Committee members, any questions for the limited
9 service deputies or the tax assessors?

10 MR. GONZALEZ: Chair Ames, this is Member
11 Gonzalez. Permission to speak?

12 MR. AMES: Absolutely. Please proceed, sir.

13 MR. GONZALEZ: I'd like to ask the ladies from
14 H-E-B and Kroger, just out of curiosity, when they're preparing
15 reports to report to the county, does it entail a package report
16 when they make payment to the respective tax offices? I'm
17 just curious as to the volume or the bulk of the work that
18 needs to be physically taken to the county courthouse.

19 Thank you.

20 MR. AMES: Thank you, Member Gonzalez.

21 If I can restate the question to both Stephanie
22 from H-E-B and Stephanie from Kroger, what is involved in
23 providing the documents to the county tax office?

24 MS. AFFLERBACH: Thank you, Mr. Ames, and thank
25 you, member, for the comment. This is Stephanie with

1 H-E-B.

2 I think that is part of our conversation today,
3 that it's not consistent across counties. If the question
4 was around payment support, we definitely do have processes
5 to streamline support for payments as they're submitted. I'm
6 not sure if that answers the question.

7 MR. AMES: What about documentation? There is
8 certainly some of the documents that must be submitted to the
9 county, not just the payment but the stubs that are taken.

10 What is the current process that H-E-B is using
11 and what is your preferred process? Some of them bring it
12 in, some of them mail it in, some of them have the county pick
13 it up.

14 MS. AFFLERBACH: Yeah. To your point earlier,
15 Officer Ames, anything electronic is preferable for us. We
16 prefer not to add costs for mailing things and liability for
17 them getting lost in the mail and additionally prefer to stay
18 away from having a partner on the road driving documentation
19 that adds a level of liability as well.

20 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie.

21 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

22 As a follow-up to that, if you had the capability,
23 H-E-B, to scan those documents and email them, would that be
24 preferable?

25 MS. AFFLERBACH: Yes, that would be preferable for

1 H-E-B.

2 MR. AMES: And does H-E-B have that ability to scan
3 those documents currently? Stephanie from H-E-B, are you
4 checking with your team?

5 MS. AFFLERBACH: Yes, we do have that ability
6 today.

7 MR. AMES: All right. Fantastic.

8 Stephanie from Kroger, same question from Member
9 Gonzalez. What is your process for submitting paperwork to
10 the county tax assessors and what's your preferred process?

11 MS. CURTIS: We have to file all paperwork involved
12 with anything that we process during a week, so that would
13 include the stubs, the weekly report.

14 For the counties that we process ACH, we have to
15 provide an ACH cover letter that allows the county to -- we're
16 basically giving the county the approval to deduct funds
17 electronically. And then if we have any misprints or voids,
18 we have to send in that paperwork, so basically the misprinted
19 car tags plus -- I can't remember the word or the verbiage
20 right now of the form, but there's an additional paperwork
21 that we have to fill out for anything that's a reprint or a
22 void to have all of that sent in.

23 And the counties that we work with, we have
24 requested, the ones that are ACH, if we can send them
25 electronically, because obviously that would really save on

1 postage costs for our counties.

2 Those two counties that we've requested that at,
3 they want everything to be sent to them via the mail or to
4 be dropped off in person. So if you can do anything on your
5 end to allow us to do everything electronically, that would
6 be so much easier overall, I think, for our team at Kroger.

7 MR. AMES: Thank you, Stephanie. We appreciate
8 that feedback.

9 And same question to you as I had to H-E-B: if
10 we were able to do some kind of scanning function, does Kroger
11 currently have the ability to scan those documents in and send
12 them?

13 MS. CURTIS: Yes, we do.

14 MR. AMES: Fantastic. Thank you very much.

15 Members, any other further questions? Members,
16 remember this is not just questions to the LSDs but also to
17 the tax assessors and to the staff. Any other further
18 questions, members?

19 (No response.)

20 MR. AMES: Member Gonzalez, your hand is still up
21 but I believe it's still up from last time, so if you have
22 a further question, be happy to address it, if not, if
23 you'll -- perfect, looks like it wend down.

24 I do have a question for DMV staff. We have heard
25 from both H-E-B and Kroger that scanning documents, submitting

1 them electronically would be preferable.

2 Does the webSUB system have capabilities for them
3 to scan into webSUB to submit to county tax assessors
4 currently? And I'll address that question to VTR Director
5 Luna and his team. Mr. Luna?

6 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
7 Registration Division director.

8 We have one of our subject matter experts from
9 webSUB that can confirm whether or not scanning capability
10 is possible.

11 MR. KRISCH: Good morning. This is Stefan Krisch,
12 director of Registration Services with VTR, TxDMV.

13 Currently we do not have a way to upload or import
14 documentation into webSUB to support this function.

15 MR. LUNA: Officer Ames, Roland Luna, Vehicle
16 Titles and Registration Division director.

17 MR. AMES: Yes, sir.

18 MR. LUNA: While we don't have the current
19 capability now, because this has been identified as an
20 efficiency and a cost reduction measure for both the tax
21 assessor-collectors and the limited service deputies, this
22 is something that we can certainly look at and partner with
23 our information technology team to see if this is something
24 that could be enhanced within the system.

25 MR. AMES: Thank you.

1 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

2 Mr. Luna, we appreciate you looking into that for
3 sure. In the meantime, if both agencies or both LSDs have
4 the ability to scan those documents and email to the tax
5 assessor, is there any violation of using the scanned documents
6 instead of paper documents or any preference by the DMV?

7 And the reason I ask it in that manner is because,
8 as many of you may or may not know, tax assessors serve as
9 an agent on behalf of the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles,
10 so we cannot make decisions on scanning or electronic documents
11 without their approval and/or express permission to do so.

12 So Mr. Luna, would the agency have any objection
13 to us receiving scanned documents through an email process
14 currently?

15 MR. LUNA: Roland Luna, Vehicle Titles and
16 Registration Division director.

17 I think that we would need to take that question
18 back and discuss internally to see what the long-term effect
19 would be, Officer Ames, and then follow up with the committee
20 so that we can make sure that we're make an informed decision
21 how it would affect the program area.

22 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Luna. I appreciate
23 that.

24 I also wanted to go back -- this is Presiding
25 Officer Ames -- Ms. Curtis, you had some very good questions

1 from Kroger about the system, and it's not germane to the
2 subject of today's meeting, but I have been informed that staff
3 from DMV will get with you on those questions and help you
4 walk through those.

5 And of course, you are certainly welcome to reach
6 out to any of your county partners with those exact same
7 questions, and we'll be happy to address those as well.

8 Committee members, any further questions to the
9 limited service deputies and/or the tax assessors and/or DMV
10 staff?

11 MS. ALIU: Yes. This is Billie Aliu. May I have
12 permission to ask another question?

13 MR. AMES: Absolutely, Member Aliu.

14 MS. ALIU: I'm a little confused on this courier
15 paper -- the couriering of the paper. Is that not something
16 that the state provides -- I know it provides it, but can it
17 not be shipped to all of these places? Because it seems like
18 H-E-B, Kroger, and most of the others are spending their
19 resources to go get this paper.

20 MR. AMES: Great question, Member Aliu.

21 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

22 My knowledge is that every county has a different
23 process. Some counties deliver the paper to their limited
24 service deputies, as we do in Dallas. You tell us when you
25 need paper, and my courier comes out and delivers it right

1 there to your front step.

2 Some counties require the limited service deputy
3 to come to the tax office to pick the paper up. We did speak
4 last time at our meeting about the possibility of the paper
5 being delivered directly from the DMV, which would cut out
6 the costs for both limited service deputies and the costs of
7 the tax assessor of having to courier paper back and forth.

8 So I think that is a very good comment.

9 DMV staff, any further questions or discussion
10 about that comment? I know we talked about it last time.
11 Have y'all had time to go back and look at that? I know that
12 initially that was not a possibility for the DMV, but Executive
13 Director Brewster said that you guys would look into that.

14 MR. THOMPSON: Presiding Officer Ames, this is
15 Clint Thompson, deputy director of VTR.

16 MR. AMES: Please proceed, Clint.

17 MR. THOMPSON: Thank you.

18 Yes, sir, that's absolutely something that we're
19 glad to look at. Like we had touched on last time, there's
20 some logistics involved in that, knowing what the bond amount
21 is relative to how much paper a particular county provides
22 a limited service deputy.

23 We have not had a chance to look into the details
24 of what that would entail, but we'll certainly do that, along
25 with the other items that Director Luna just identified.

1 MR. AMES: Thank you, Mr. Thompson.

2 This is Presiding Officer Ames

3 One further question on that, Clint. Do you know
4 off the top of your head how many pieces of sticker paper there
5 are in a box?

6 MR. THOMPSON: Clint Thompson, deputy director of
7 VTR.

8 I do not off the top of my head, but I'm willing
9 to bet we have more than one person on this call that knows
10 how many pieces of sticker paper are in there.

11 MR. AMES: Fantastic. I seem to recall it's 2,500
12 pieces, but I may be --

13 MR. THOMPSON: Yeah, that's what I was thinking,
14 but didn't know if I was confusing that with the actual receipt
15 paper, the RTS-500.

16 MR. AMES: And we both may be confusing it, Clint,
17 for sure. But if anybody else from DMV knows how many sticker
18 papers there is in a box.

19 And the reason I mention that, members, is
20 sometimes the bond is directly related to the amount of paper
21 that the limited service deputy has on its stock. If you will
22 recall, the sticker paper is a blank piece of paper with the
23 sticker on there, and so it is valuable.

24 Every registration in Texas is between \$70 and \$80,
25 and so essentially, every single piece of paper in that box

1 is worth between \$70 and \$80, and every county tax assessor
2 sets their bond based on what they believe their risk level
3 is.

4 And so for example, if some limited service
5 deputies are only receiving 500 pieces of paper and some are
6 receiving 2,500 pieces of paper, the risk at that level is
7 different.

8 Let me just ask this question to our partners from
9 H-E-B and Kroger. Do you know are each one of your locations
10 receiving a standard amount of paper every time, or does each
11 location receive a different amount of paper?

12 I'll start with Stephanie from H-E-B. Stephanie,
13 are you still on the line?

14 MS. AFFLERBACH: Thank you, Officer Ames.

15 I will have to clarify. It was my understanding
16 that they were different amounts by county.

17 MR. AMES: Fantastic. Do you believe, Stephanie,
18 that if you received a standard amount of paper at every
19 location that would help streamline your processes?

20 MS. AFFLERBACH: We also have procedures I place
21 for the store to inventory the paper, because we acknowledge
22 that it's valuable, so the same process we have for making
23 sure we don't lose track of stamps or cash, we do for the paper
24 as well, so we have internal processes to protect the paper.

25 MR. AMES: Thank you.

1 This is Presiding Officer Ames.

2 Stephanie, we appreciate your steadfastness in
3 this, because that is definitely a valuable resource, as you
4 stated.

5 Stephanie from Kroger, Stephanie Curtis, do your
6 stores receive a standard amount of paper at each location,
7 and if not, would that be something that would be a valuable
8 efficiency for you all?

9 Ms. Curtis, you may have to hit *3 again. Ms.
10 Curtis?

11 MS. CURTIS: We would have to double-check with
12 our stores just to see if they do get the same amount, but
13 we do -- like I said before, we have several counties, and
14 some of those counties are a little bit higher volume, some
15 stores do higher volume of car tags versus some of the
16 neighboring stores, so for us I kind of want to say that getting
17 a -- like let's say it's 2,500 delivered across the board
18 delivered every month, it might work for some stores; it might
19 not work for all stores.

20 But then again, like I said, we'd have to get
21 clarification to see what inventory levels most stores utilize
22 monthly just to get through the car tag business that we do.

23 MR. AMES: Fantastic. Thank you, Stephanie. We
24 appreciate that feedback.

25 MR. THOMPSON: Presiding Officer Ames, Clint

1 Thompson, deputy director VTR.

2 MR. AMES: Absolutely. Proceed, Clint

3 MR. THOMPSON: It looks like we have 1,500
4 registration stickers. The 2,500 was the receipt papers.
5 It's 1,500 registration stickers per box.

6 MR. AMES: 1500. We both stand corrected. 1500
7 stickers and 2,500 receipts. And the locations get both.
8 Correct? They both get receipt paper and the sticker paper.
9 Correct?

10 MR. THOMPSON: Clint Thompson, deputy director
11 VTR.

12 It's my understanding they only get the actual
13 sticker paper, not the actual receipt paper as well. But
14 Stefan and Romeo are on this call if they want to confirm that
15 for me.

16 MR. AMES: Presiding Officer Ames here. I'm not
17 sure how they get a receipt from their transaction if they
18 don't get receipt paper also.

19 Stefan, could you confirm?

20 I tell you what, let me ask this to the tax assessors
21 on the call. Ms. French or Mr. Riggs, are you aware if your
22 limited service deputies receive both sticker and receipt
23 paper, or just sticker paper?

24 MS. FRENCH: Presiding Officer Ames, this is
25 Michelle French.

1 Our limited service deputies receive the sticker
2 paper. I do not believe that they receive receipt paper as
3 well; it's only the stickers.

4 MR. AMES: Only sticker paper. Okay, great.

5 Romeo, I saw you on here today, so please proceed.

6 MR. McCAIN: Yes. Thank you, Presiding Officer
7 Ames. This is Romeo McCain for the record.

8 I just wanted to reiterate as well, as she mentioned
9 the sticker paper is what's provided; receipt paper wouldn't
10 be. So the customer would leave with the sticker in hand.

11 MR. AMES: Thank you. Thank you, Romeo, for that
12 information. We appreciate it.

13 MR. McCAIN: You're welcome, sir.

14 MR. AMES: Committee members, any further
15 questions for either parties, presenters today or DMV staff?
16 Committee members, any further questions?

17 Stefan Krisch, your hand is up. Did you want to
18 add to that conversation or just confirm what we heard?

19 MR. KRISCH: My apologies. I was just confirming.
20 Thank you.

21 MR. AMES: Thank you. It's good to know that we
22 are all on the same page.

23 All right. Committee members, hearing no further
24 comments, at this time do we have any suggestions or motions
25 that need to be made considering this item? Committee

1 members, any suggestions or motions considering this item?

2 (No response.)

3 MR. AMES: As Presiding Officer Ames, I would like
4 to make a motion that we ask that the limited service deputies,
5 the county tax assessors association, and the Texas Department
6 of Motor Vehicles work together to develop a -- what was the
7 term that was used -- a best practices model that can be rolled
8 out to both county tax assessors and limited service deputies.
9 And I believe by having both parties working with the DMV,
10 that model can be rolled out.

11 At this time I believe it can probably be rolled
12 out in just a best practices document, but if need be, the
13 DMV could assist in the rulemaking process to make sure that
14 all counties are following that best practices document.

15 Would that be something that would be acceptable
16 to the committee? Do I hear any committee members who would
17 like to second that or have discussion based on that?

18 MR. HAYTER: I'll second that. This is Russell
19 Hayter.

20 MR. AMES: Thank you, Member Hayter. Mr. Hayter,
21 any comments?

22 (No response.).

23 MR. AMES: Okay. Hearing none from Mr. Hayter,
24 any other comments or discussion from any other of the members?

25 MR. GONZALEZ: Chairman Ames, Member Gonzalez.

1 MR. AMES: Yes, sir, Member Gonzalez. Go forward.

2 MR. GONZALEZ: I'd like to reiterate your
3 recommendation, because I think that would be the solution
4 to identify what the problems are and weaknesses by getting
5 together, because we do have some big counties and small
6 counties that operate differently, and I think we could
7 pinpoint and identify a solution to each one. So I would
8 second your recommendation for us to do that.

9 MR. AMES: Thank you, Member Gonzalez. We have
10 a second from Member Hayter already, but we'll consider yours
11 a third. How's that?

12 So we'll move forward. Hearing no further
13 discussion, any further discussion regarding the motion? Any
14 further discussion regarding the motion?

15 (No response.)

16 MR. AMES: Hearing no further discussion regarding
17 the motion, I'll now do a roll call of the advisory committee
18 members. Please respond verbally when I call your name.

19 We have a motion by Presiding Officer Ames to ask
20 the Tax Assessor-Collector Association, the limited service
21 deputies, and the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles to develop
22 a best practices handbook in regards to limited service
23 deputies doing registration renewals on behalf of Texas
24 counties, and that motion does include, if needed and required,
25 the DMV may research and implement rules based to help

1 implement that handbook.

2 Hearing no further discussion, I will now call.

3 Member Aliu, are you in favor of the motion?

4 MS. ALIU: This is Member Aliu, and yes, I am in
5 favor. Thank you.

6 MR. AMES: Thank you.

7 I will only call out the members who were present
8 earlier, so if another member has joined since then, please
9 let me know at the end of discussion.

10 Member Cavender, are you in favor of the motion?

11 MR. CAVENDER: Member Cavender approves.

12 MR. AMES: Thank you.

13 Member Gaston, are you in favor of the motion?

14 MR. GASTON: Member Gaston. I am in favor of the
15 motion.

16 MR. AMES: Member Gonzalez, are you in favor of
17 the motion?

18 MR. GONZALEZ: Yes, I'm in favor of the motion.

19 MR. AMES: Member Hayter, assume you're in favor
20 the motion since you seconded it.

21 MR. HAYTER: Aye. Russell Hayter, aye.

22 MR. AMES: Thank you.

23 Member Hoyt, are you in favor of the motion?

24 Member Hoyt? Member Hoyt?

25 (No response.)

1 MR. AMES: They must have stepped away
2 Member King, are you favor of the motion?

3 MS. KING: Member King is in favor.

4 MR. AMES: Fantastic.

5 Member Stidham, are you in favor of the motion?

6 Member Stidham? Member Stidham?

7 MR. STIDHAM: I vote aye.

8 MR. AMES: Thank you, Member Stidham.

9 Member Sutton, are you in favor of the motion?

10 MS. SUTTON: Susan Sutton in favor of the motion.

11 MR. AMES: Fantastic.

12 And Member Wall, are you in favor of the motion?

13 MR. WALL: Member Wall. I am in favor of the
14 motion.

15 MR. AMES: Fantastic.

16 And I, John Ames, am also in favor as the motion
17 maker. It looks like we have a unanimous in favor of the motion
18 of the members present.

19 Thank you, members, for your presence today and
20 for allowing us to do that. I really appreciate that. We're
21 going to move forward with that.

22 Mr. Luna or Ms. Brewster, any comments concerning
23 the motion or concerns?

24 MR. BOGGUS: Officer Ames?

25 MR. AMES: Yes, Member Boggus.

1 MR. BOGGUS: This is Member Boggus. I got on late
2 or I finally figured out how to work my mic, but I'm in favor
3 of the motion.

4 MR. AMES: Oh, thank you, Member Boggus. I
5 appreciate that.

6 MR. BOGGUS: Thank you.

7 MR. DRAKE: Officer Ames, this is Member Drake.

8 Likewise I joined late, and I also was listening
9 on the phone call in the early part of the meeting, and I am
10 in favor.

11 MR. AMES: Thank you. Thank you, Member Drake.
12 Any other members that I've missed?

13 (No response.)

14 MR. AMES: Okay. We appreciate it.

15 Mr. Luna or Ms. Brewster?

16 MS. BREWSTER: Presiding Officer Ames, this is
17 Whitney Brewster, executive director.

18 I really appreciate all of the great dialogue today
19 and look forward to working with the different parties on
20 developing a best practices document. Thank you.

21 MR. AMES: Wonderful. Thank you, Ms. Brewster.

22 I did just receive a message from Member Hoyt.
23 She has lost her audio for some reason, and she was frantically
24 saying she was in favor of the motion, so we'll record Member
25 Hoyt as also in favor of the motion. So that's great.

1 Wonderful. Well, I appreciate the members today.
2 I really, really want to say thank you to the limited service
3 deputies, the Stephanies that were on the call, Stephanie from
4 H-E-B and Stephanie from Kroger, and your teams that were with
5 you today. We really appreciate your feedback. And I really
6 appreciate the Honorable French and Riggs being here today
7 and providing information.

8 I believe this has been a very good positive
9 discussion and all parties do want to move forward and create
10 efficiencies, which is what we should be doing every day in
11 all of our lives, right, creating efficiencies and making our
12 return on investment and everything we do better. So thank
13 you all for your discussion today and for being here.

14 So at this time we will now move on to item number
15 3. Mr. Richards, item number 3 is public comment. Are there
16 any comments from the public?

17 MR. RICHARDS: Presiding Officer Ames, David
18 Richards. May I have the floor, please?

19 MR. AMES: Yes, sir.

20 MR. RICHARDS: I believe we have one public
21 commenter, Rashim Muhammad.

22 Mr. Muhammad, are you on the line? Mr. Muhammad,
23 are you on the line?

24 (No response.)

25 MR. RICHARDS: Presiding Officer Ames, he was on

1 the call earlier and had indicated he was going to call back.

2 Staff has reached out to him during the meeting to confirm
3 that he wanted to come back and make a public comment.

4 Let me ask him one more time. Mr. Rashim Muhammad,
5 are you on this call?

6 (No response.)

7 MR. RICHARDS: Presiding Officer Ames -- Mr.
8 Muhammad, if you're on the call, please unmute.

9 MR. AMES: Mr. Muhammad, you may have to press *3.
10 Mr. Valdez, do you see Mr. Muhammad on the call?

11 MR. VALDEZ: This is David Valdez.

12 No, I do not see his hand raised.

13 MR. AMES: We'll call one last time. Mr.
14 Muhammad, are you on the call for public comment?

15 (No response.)

16 MR. AMES: Okay. Hearing him not on the call, Mr.
17 Richards, can we move forward to our next public commenter?

18 MR. RICHARDS: There are no other public
19 commenters at this time.

20 MR. AMES: All right. Thank you, Mr. Richards.

21 MR. RICHARDS: You're welcome.

22 MR. AMES: Committee, we will now move to agenda
23 item number 4. Do we have anyone who would like to motion
24 to adjourn as item number 4?

25 MR. CAVENDER: I would move to adjourn. Member

1 Cavender.

2 MR. AMES: Thank you, Member Cavender.

3 Do we have a second for adjournment?

4 MR. BOGGUS: Member Boggus. I'll second it.

5 MR. AMES: Thank you. Member Boggus. Thank you,
6 Member Boggus.

7 We have a motion and a second to adjourn. At this
8 time we will adjourn the CSAC meeting at 10:27 a.m. on December
9 13, 2021.

10 Thank you all for your service. Have a great
11 afternoon.

12 (Whereupon, at 10:27 a.m., the meeting was
13 adjourned.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

C E R T I F I C A T E

MEETING OF: TxDMV Consumer Service Advisory Committee

LOCATION: Austin, Texas

DATE: December 13, 2021

I do hereby certify that the foregoing pages, numbers 1 through 64, inclusive, are the true, accurate, and complete transcript prepared from the verbal recording made by electronic recording by Nancy H. King before the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles.

DATE: December 21, 2021

/s/ Nancy H. King
(Transcriber)

On the Record Reporting
7703 N. Lamar Blvd., #515
Austin, Texas 78752